



Central New York Regional Planning & Development Board

126 N. Salina Street, Suite 200, Syracuse, New York 13202 • Tel. (315) 422-8276 • Fax (315) 422-9051

Kathleen A. Rapp, Chair

David V. Bottar, Executive Director

CNY RPDB Meeting

June 20, 2012

12:00 noon – 1:30 p.m.

126 North Salina Street  
Syracuse, New York 13202  
(Lower Level Conference Room)

*James Rafte, Presiding*

## AGENDA

- |    |  |              |
|----|--|--------------|
| 1. | Call to Order  | James Rafte  |
| 2. | Approval of Day's Agenda and Minutes from the April 18, 2012 Meeting   | James Rafte  |
| 3. | <b>CNY Regional Energy and Sustainability Plan</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Neil Webb, Energy Specialist<br/>O'Brien and Gere Engineers</li></ul>   | Neil Webb    |
| 6. | Executive Director's Report <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Consultant Selections – Green House Gas Inventory and Stormwater Modeling Project</li><li>• Onondaga County's Draft Sustainable Plan</li><li>• Executive Committee Meeting July 18, 2012</li><li>• Board Meeting August 15, 2012</li></ul> | David Bottar |
| 7. | Old/New Business   | James Rafte  |
| 8. | Adjournment  | James Rafte  |



Central New York Regional Planning & Development Board  
126 N. Salina Street, Suite 200, Syracuse, New York 13202 • Tel. (315) 422-8276 • Fax (315) 422-9051  
Kathleen A. Rapp, Chair David V. Bottar, Executive Director

## MINUTES

### Central New York Regional Planning and Development Board Board of Directors Meeting June 20, 2012

#### ATTENDANCE

**Board Members:** Cynthia Aikman, Lawrence Baker, Daniel Dineen, David Elleman, Scott Ingmire, Louella LeClair, Mary Ann Messinger, Ralph Monforte, James Murphy, Michael Plochocki, James Rafté, Danny Ross, William Southern, David Turner, Paul Vickery, Keith Welch, and Steven Zabriskie.

**Guests:** Jake Barrett, City of Syracuse Common Councilor; Megan Costa, SOCPA; Susan Crossett, Harris Beach PLLC; Steven Eckler, O'Brien & Gere; Jim Fayle, Empire State Development; John Ferguson, Assemblyman Magnarelli's office; Lynn Fox, Congresswoman Buerkle's office; Don Jordon, Syracuse-Onondaga Planning Agency; Bob Lotkowitz, Village of Skaneateles; Jason MacLeod, O'Brien & Gere; John Marshall, EDA; Yolanda Pagano, O'Brien & Gere; Dave Reed, F.O.C.U.S. Greater Syracuse; Alex Walsh, Senator DeFrancisco's office, Neil Webb, O'Brien & Gere.

**Staff:** David Bottar, Kathleen Bertuch, Christopher Carrick, Jeanie Gleisner, Bruce Keplinger, David Kubek, Karen Novak, Brian Pincelli, Carolyn Ramsden, Cindy Reilly, Michael Rosanio and Kay Wakeman.

#### BUSINESS MEETING

##### 1. CALL TO ORDER

Secretary James Rafté called the meeting to order at 12:30 p.m. at the office of the CNY RPDB in Syracuse, New York.

##### 2. APPROVAL OF MEETING AGENDA AND MINUTES

The first order of business was a review of the day's agenda and minutes from the April 18, 2012 meeting. A motion was introduced and seconded to accept the agenda and minutes as presented; the motion was approved unanimously.

##### 3. PRESENTATION

David Bottar provided a brief overview of the NYSERDA Cleaner, Greener Communities Regional Sustainability Planning program, noting this is a statewide initiative that is focused on

preparation of regional energy and sustainability plans for ten designated regions across the State. Mr. Bottar noted that these plans must be completed by December 31, 2012 and that each region has received \$1 million in financial support from NYSERDA to support preparation of these plans. Mr. Bottar noted that two consultant groups have been retained by the agency to assist staff with the preparation of the plan including a team lead by O'Brien and Gere Engineers in Syracuse and a second team is lead by the Arup Group from New York City.

Mr. Bottar noted that staff started work on the project in May 2012 and that the CNY RPDB will serve as the steering committee for the agency's work on the regional sustainability plan. Mr. Bottar noted that communities in CNY will have the opportunity to compete for \$90 million of State capital funding for projects recommended in the plan.

Mr. Bottar introduced Chris Carrick who serves as the agency's Energy Program Manager. Mr. Carrick referred to a handout with background information about the project, including the overall project completion schedule, meeting schedule for the Steering Committee, and a list of members of an Expert Advisory Committee that has been formed by the agency.

Mr. Carrick noted the NYSERDA Cleaner, Greener Communities Program is a major State initiative that is being strongly supported by the Governor's Office and is being closely coordinated with the NYS DEC Climate Smart Communities Program, which is a voluntary commitment that municipalities can take to assess and reduce their energy use and carbon footprint. According to guidelines set by NYSERDA, the regional sustainability plans must address several sustainability issues including energy and climate, transportation and land use, water and waste water treatment, solid waste, economic development and governance.

Mr. Carrick noted that the regional plan fits with other activities underway through the agency's Energy Management Program, including the Central New York Energy Challenge and the Solarize Madison Program. Scott Ingmire, Madison County Planning Director, described the objective of the Solarize Madison Program, which is to double the amount of installed solar PV systems in the County by offering a bulk purchase discount and additional \$2,000 incentive to the first 15 residential customers who sign up to participate.

Mr. Carrick recognized members of the O'Brien and Gere team in attendance including Steve Eckler, Yolanda Pagano, Neil Webb, and Susan Crosett from Harris Beach Solutions.

Ms. Pagano began her remarks by noting the NYS Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative has provided nearly \$1 billion in funding for strategic energy projects across the State over the past five years. Ms. Pagano reviewed information prepared by NYSERDA regarding the region's carbon footprint, noting that CNY has a relatively small footprint in terms of total emissions, but its per-capita emissions are large, second only to the North Country region.

Mr. Webb presented additional information regarding the energy profile of the State and region. In reviewing this information, Mr. Webb noted that nearly 100 kWh need to be produced in order to deliver 30 kWh to the final customer, because of the loss of heat energy at the power plant and the loss of energy through the transmission and distribution grid. Looking at trends and forecast of New York State energy use, Mr. Webb noted there is a general trend of increasing energy consumption, but also a great opportunity to lower the amount of energy that is needed to be

produced through increased energy efficiency and the installation of on-site renewable energy by customers.

Looking at the State's energy resource mix, Mr. Webb noted there is a diversity of energy sources including large amounts of hydroelectric and nuclear power. It was also noted that while Central New York has a wide diversity of energy sources, approximately half of the region's installed energy generation capacity comes from fossil fuels. However, Mr. Webb indicated that when the actual energy production (output) of the region's energy producers is taken into account, 84% of the electricity comes from nuclear power and 13% from natural gas powered plants.

Regarding renewable energy, Mr. Webb presented information noting that renewable energy sources meet nearly 20% of Germany's total electricity consumption of 612 billion kWh per year (total consumption in the areas of Central New York served by National Grid is approximately 5 billion kWh per year, approximately the annual output of the Nine Mile 1 plant). In presenting this data, it was noted that Germany produces nearly 24 times the amount of electricity from renewable energy sources as Central New York needs in electricity consumption. Mr. Webb indicated that Germany has achieved its success in promoting renewable energy sources through policies such as the Feed-In-Tariff (FIT), which pays developers who install renewable energy a direct subsidy for each kWh they supply to the electric grid.

Additional information provided by Mr. Webb included data regarding the status of renewable energy in NYS. It was noted that proposed additions to New York's electricity supply will primarily come from wind and natural gas facilities, with 7,000 MW coming from wind representing nearly 25% of the state's total current peak electricity demand. Mr. Webb referenced a report provided by the National Renewable Energy Lab that estimates that large direct-to-grid wind farms could provide 52% of the State's current electricity needs. It was also noted that other technologies such as on-site (customer-sited, behind-the-meter) wind, anaerobic digesters, fuel cells, customer-sited solar PV and solar thermal installations have potential in Central New York.

Mr. Webb referenced additional data which shows that approximately 74 million dekatherms of natural gas is consumed by National Grid customers in Central New York, an amount that is expected to grow with new supplies made available through the Marcellus Shale development and high demand industries in Oswego County such as the ethanol plant.

It was also noted that NYS was one of the first to build out its energy transmission infrastructure in the early 1900's and because of its age this system needs significant capital investment, as recognized by the Governor's New York Energy Highway initiative. In addition, Mr. Webb noted that nearly two-thirds of the region's energy generation mix is over 30 years old, with the hydroelectricity facilities on the St. Lawrence River and Niagara area over 100 years old. Additional reference was made to the fact that all of the major nuclear facilities operating in Upstate New York are currently operating on a 20-year license extension. Given the age of these facilities, Mr. Webb suggested there is an opportunity for long-term planning to reduce energy consumption and find renewable substitutes to help meet the region's future energy production needs.

In making these recommendations, Mr. Webb noted that New York State is a leader in terms of charting a more sustainable energy path, and there are many examples of local leadership such as Madison County's solar PV landfill cap, green roof projects at the Syracuse Center of Excellence, Onondaga County correctional facility and SUNY-ESF, and the Dewitt Town Hall solar PV installation.

At the conclusion of the formal remarks from the O'Brien and Gere team, members and guests were afforded the opportunity to offer comments and ask questions regarding the presentation.

David Turner from Oswego County asked about limits to placing small scale renewable energy systems that run intermittently like solar PV onto the grid. Mr. Webb responded that the scale of installation of distributed generation systems is not expected to outpace the smart grid investments that can manage such systems. In addition, Mr. Webb noted that while utilities generally follow a "15% rule", which limits the amount of distributed renewable energy systems that can make up the total peak demand on the portion of the grid that serves residential areas, there is research from the U.S. DOE that suggests that the limit can be safely raised to 25% of peak load. Mr. Webb also noted that Germany recently reached 50% of total power production from solar PV in May 2012.

Louella LeClair asked whether renewable energy might be produced at lower prices than traditional sources and what impacts that might have on nuclear power plants, National Grid, and the jobs and taxes these provide for municipalities. Mr. Webb responded that the deregulated electricity sector is divided between generation and distribution. In making this point, Mr. Webb indicated the real issue of concern for independent power producers is the age of centralized generation facilities. In evaluating these systems, Mr. Webb noted that while local customer-owned renewable energy systems relieves the pressure to build new costly power plants, the development of these systems has the potential to be a major job producer in communities where these systems are deployed.

David Turner asked whether the distributed generation systems under consideration with the plan would likely fall under the State's net metering caps (currently 2 MW for non-residential solar, wind and micro-hydroelectric, 1.5 MW for non-residential fuel cells, 1 MW for farm-based biogas). Susan Crossett responded that there are Statewide caps for renewable energy systems but that we are far from reaching those caps and individual customers are limited to 110% of their annual demand in order to get NYSERDA incentives.

Mr. Carrick noted that the CNY plan must recognize existing State policies in terms of identifying projects for funding through Phase 2 of Cleaner Greener Communities program. However, it was also noted that the plan could include policy recommendations that would encourage further development of renewable resources in NYS. Mr. Carrick indicated an example of this approach would be "virtual net metering" where separate property owners could all use the energy produced from a collectively purchased solar PV system.

Michael Plochocki asked whether the plan will look at utility rate structures. Mr. Carrick responded that while this issue will not be a major focus of the plan, that information will be presented about current rates in CNY and what steps can be taken to help reduce these rates in the future.

David Turner asked whether the plan will look at the contribution that municipal waste-to-energy (WTE) systems can make to local energy generation. Mr. Carrick responded that Barton and Loguidice Engineers, which is part of the O'Brien and Gere team will look at WTE, as well as other practices like composting of organics, and that individuals with expertise in waste management such as Mark Lichtenstein from the Syracuse Center of Excellence, Frank Visser, Oswego County Solid Waste Director, and Ravi Raman, chair of OCRRA have agreed to sit on the plan's Expert Advisory Committee.

David Elleman asked what the potential of solar PV is in Central New York. Mr. Bottar noted previous information that was presented during the panel discussion where it was referenced that Germany recently produced 50% of its electricity through solar PV during one weekend in May.

Danny Ross noted that he is on the Board of Directors for the CNY Regional Market in Syracuse and their facility has saved substantial amounts of money as a result of its solar PV installation. Mr. Carrick noted that there are opportunities to install large solar PV farms (above 2 MW) in the region. Scott Ingmire noted that there are several wind farms in Madison County, and one that is currently proposed is controversial, but that solar PV is generally well received by the public.

Ralph Monforte asked whether other resources like micro-hydroelectric power could be included in the plan, as well as solar PV and wind. Mr. Carrick noted that there would be opportunities to include other resources.

Cynthia Aikman noted that Cayuga County and the City of Auburn have an Energy Plan and asked whether opportunities identified in the community plan would be included in the regional initiative. Mr. Carrick said that the regional plan will incorporate ideas from already adopted plans. Ms. Aikman asked whether public transportation will be included in the plan, especially opportunities to expand service for rural areas. Mr. Bottar noted that the region's Metropolitan Transportation Planning Organization, the Syracuse Metropolitan Transportation Council, is currently updating their Long-Range Transportation Plan and that information and recommendations from this planning initiative regarding rural services will be incorporated into the regional sustainability plan.

James Fayle referenced the Regional Economic Development Councils (REDCs) initiative that was advanced by the Governor this past year and noted the importance that work on the regional sustainability plan be carefully coordinated with efforts underway by the CNY REDC. Mr. Carrick noted that staff has already made a formal presentation to the CNY REDC regarding this initiative and will continue to work closely with the CNY REDC and its staff in the months ahead.

#### **4. EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS REPORT**

Mr. Bottar provided a brief executive director's report. As part of this report, it was noted that the Executive Committee has approved the selection of ICF Consulting to work on the agency's NYYSERDA Green House Gas Inventory and C&S Engineers to assist staff with the development of a regional stormwater computer model. Reference was also made to a post employment benefit actuarial report that was reviewed by the Executive Committee at their

meeting in May along with work the Executive Committee will do at their July 18<sup>th</sup> meeting regarding a review of the agency's 2011 financial audit along with a federal Economic Development Administration District Performance Evaluation report.

Regarding current program work, Mr. Bottar noted that the Syracuse and Onondaga County Planning Agency has completed work on a draft sustainability plan for Onondaga County. Comments were also offered regarding staff work on various projects that are tied to the upcoming NYS Consolidated Funding round in July.

Mr. Bottar announced that the next Board meeting would take place on August 15<sup>th</sup>, as scheduled, and will be held at the SUNY Morrisville main campus in Morrisville, New York.

#### **5. OLD/NEW BUSINESS**

There was no information presented or discussed under old or new business.

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business to discuss, a motion was introduced and seconded to adjourn the meeting; the motion was approved unanimously.

Respectfully Submitted,

---

James Rafte, Secretary